

## **American Workforce Policy Advisory Board Meeting Minutes**

September 18, 2019

The American Workforce Policy Advisory Board convened its third meeting at 9:15 a.m. (EDT) on September 18, 2019, at the Boys & Girls Clubs of Greater Washington (Richard England Clubhouse #14) 4103 Benning Rd. NE, Washington, DC 20019.

In accordance with the provisions of Public Law 92-463, the meeting was open to the public from 9:15 a.m. to 11:07 a.m. (EDT) via audio conference technology. An audience of Board member staff and credentialed members of the press were present in the room during the meeting.

### **Board members present:**

1. Ivanka Trump, Advisor to the President, White House (Co-chair)
2. Wilbur Ross, Secretary, U.S. Department of Commerce (Co-chair)
3. Jay Box, President, Kentucky Community and Technical College System
4. Walter Bumphus, President and CEO, American Association of Community Colleges
5. Jim Clark, CEO, Boys & Girls Clubs of America
6. Tom Donohue, CEO, U.S. Chamber of Commerce
7. Juanita Duggan, President and CEO, National Federation for Independent Business
8. Elizabeth Goettl, President and CEO, Cristo Rey Network
9. Marillyn Hewson, CEO, Lockheed Martin
10. Eric Holcomb, Governor, State of Indiana
11. Barbara Humpton, CEO, Siemens USA
12. Al Kelly, Chairman and CEO, VISA
13. Vi Lyles, Mayor, Charlotte, North Carolina
14. Bill McDermott, CEO, SAP America
15. Sean McGarvey, President, North America's Building and Trades Unions
16. Michael Piwowar, Executive Director, Milken Institute
17. Scott Pulsipher, President, Western Governors University
18. Kim Reynolds, Governor, State of Iowa
19. Ginni Rometty, CEO, IBM
20. Scott Sanders, Executive Director, National Association of State Workforce Agencies
21. Johnny C. Taylor, Jr., President and CEO, Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)
22. Jay Timmons, CEO, National Association of Manufacturers

23. Sheree Utash, President, Wichita State University Tech
24. Marianne Wanamaker, Professor, University of Tennessee

**Members not in attendance:**

1. Tim Cook, CEO, Apple
2. Doug McMillon, President and CEO, Walmart
3. Craig Menear, Chairman and CEO, Home Depot

**Also in attendance:**

1. Chris Liddell, Deputy Chief of Staff for Policy Coordination, White House

**Also presenting during the meeting:**

1. Ann Gould Rubin, Vice-President, Corporate Marketing, IBM
2. Kian Kamyab, Data Scientist, SAP.iO Venture Studio, SAP

## **I. WELCOME**

### **Remarks by Ms. Ivanka Trump**

Ms. Trump welcomed the Board members and thanked Boys & Girls Clubs of America CEO, Jim Clark, for hosting the meeting. She recognized the Boys & Girls Clubs of America for their incredible programs for creating job readiness in the next generation. Several of the Board members toured the facility before the meeting. Ms. Trump thanked the students and educators who met the Board members that morning.

Ms. Trump thanked the Board for their work since the last meeting. She also reviewed selected statistics and federal actions taken since the June meeting. Statistics included:

- Statistics from the U.S. Census Bureau that indicated an increase in real medium incomes in the United States and falling poverty rates for African Americans and Hispanics.
- Statistics indicating that most new hires of prime age working adults were minorities. Women, specifically African American women, are predominantly driving this trend.
- Women make up the majority of the college-educated workforce in our country. During the 2018 and 2019 school year, the number of female students and the number of students representing historically underrepresented groups taking AP computer science both increased.

Actions included:

- A celebration of the 1-year anniversary of the Pledge to America's Workers, with over 350 companies signing the pledge, committing to skills training, apprenticeships, and on-the-job learning for workers.
- The Department of Labor proposed a new "rule making" that established high-quality, industry-recognized apprenticeship programs.

- The Council of Economic Advisers released a report assessing the evidence on the performance of government employment and training programs, finding that many of the programs lacked rigorous evidence of improved wage and employment outcomes for recipients.
- The President issued an executive order announcing the development of an American artificial intelligence (AI) initiative, a strategy that includes training workers in using AI in emerging occupations. The White House also held the second annual summit to discuss the promise of AI technologies. Ms. Trump thanked Chris Liddell for his leadership in this area.

Ms. Trump remarked that at today's meeting the Advisory Board would hear from each of the four working groups and vote on the first set of recommendations that would be made to the National Council of the American Worker—the inter-agency taskforce charged with implementation. She noted that in December, the Advisory Board will continue to share recommendations, all of which will help inform the Council's National Workforce Strategy.

### **Remarks by Jim Clark, CEO, Boys & Girls Clubs of America**

Mr. Clark thanked the members for attending, noting that this had been an opportunity to see firsthand the importance of the Board's mission. The children and teens that the Board members met represent hundreds of thousands of young people who have had the opportunity for workforce/job readiness training at Boys & Girls Clubs. But what's really important, he remarked, is the opportunities that lie ahead. Hundreds of thousands, millions more, would like to have the type of experiences that the Board Members had seen that morning. He noted that it was the quest of the Boys & Girls Clubs to double the youth that they are able to serve over the next 6 to 7 years. He pointed out that the bipartisan Youth Workforce Readiness Act would be introduced in Congress in the next week. It would support many of the activities the Board members had seen that morning. Many public and private institutions had been instrumental in making that possible. He indicated that there are four key areas to the Boys & Girls Clubs pathway to workforce readiness:

1. Essential skills development
2. Career exposure
3. Employability skills (up to and including credentials)
4. Work experience (internships, paid apprenticeships, or other opportunities)

### **Remarks by Secretary Wilbur Ross**

Secretary Ross outlined the [agenda](#) and the goals of the meeting. He noted that the Board would hear from the co-chairs of the four working groups.

Secretary Ross noted the importance of improving workforce participation and reducing skills mismatches. He called on the Board members to deliver actionable recommendations. He outlined the structure of the meeting. Each working group's co-chairs would have 20 minutes to present their recommendations. The Board would discuss the recommendations after each presentation. After that the Chairs would open the floor briefly for additional thoughts and then hold a voice vote on each working group's set of recommendations.

## II. PRESENTATION OF WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS

Ms. Trump acknowledged the hard work of the White House and Department of Commerce staff. Then she asked Ms. Rometty to begin the presentations.

The Working Group recommendation presentations were accompanied by [discussion slides](#). Selected slides have been included in these minutes.

### Working Group to Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success

**Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success**

**Co-chairs**  
Ginni Rometty, Chairman, President & CEO, IBM  
Tim Cook, CEO, Apple

**Members**  
Jay Box, President, Kentucky Community and Technical College System  
Walter Bumphus, President & CEO, American Association of Community Colleges  
Jim Clark, President & CEO, Boys & Girls Clubs of America  
Juanita Duggan, President & CEO, National Federation for Independent Business  
Elizabeth Goettl, President & CEO, Cristo Rey Network  
Marilyn Hewson, Chairman, President & CEO, Lockheed Martin  
Eric Holcomb, Governor, State of Indiana  
Barbara Humpton, CEO, Siemens USA  
Vi Lyles, Mayor, City of Charlotte  
Sean McGarvey, President, North America's Building Trades Unions  
Doug McMillon, President & CEO, Walmart  
Craig Menear, Chairman, President, & CEO, The Home Depot  
Kim Reynolds, Governor, State of Iowa  
Scott Pulsipher, President, Western Governors University  
Sheree Utash, President, Wichita State Technical University

Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

**Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success**

The two cornerstones of an enduring national campaign to promote alternative pathways are:

- the creation of a large-scale, yearlong advertising campaign; and
- sustained advocacy across a wide range of key stakeholders.

**Recommendation**

Develop a Private Sector-led National Campaign to Raise Awareness of and Promote Multiple Pathways to Well-Paying Jobs for All Americans.

### Remarks by Ms. Ginni Rometty, Working Group Co-Chair

Ms. Rometty thanked the co-chairs and Mr. Clark, on behalf of the Board members, for the unique experiences of the previous 24 hours.

Ms. Rometty reminded the Board that the working group that she co-chairs with Tim Cook is focused on the new paradigms needed—first, skills versus degrees, and second, the multiple pathways to being able to get a new role, a new job, a good job. She noted that the working group was focused on both young people and mid-career people. She noted the working group’s specific focus was twofold, that is: 1) a marketing campaign to highlight these pathways, and 2) over time, providing some recommendations about policy.

She reiterated a key statistic for the working group, that only one-third of Americans have a bachelor’s degree. Those without bachelor’s degrees represented an untapped potential in the digital era. She noted that 15 percent of her firm’s hiring in the previous year was “new collar.” Her firm coined this term to describe people who don’t have a 4-year degree, but who have built the skills and credentials to contribute to areas like the cloud and the cyber sector. She noted a study by the National Science Board that highlighted the potential of workers like these.

Ms. Rometty then described the proposed marketing campaign, which would:

- Highlight that “you” can get a great job through many different routes without a 4-year degree
- Highlight that there are many pathways through different kinds of education
- Use real life stories with emotional appeal
- Emphasize the importance of lifelong learning

She noted that the Board Members and other interested stakeholders would have the opportunity to get involved in two ways:

1. Contributions (Ms. Rometty referred to a discussion that had taken place at a non-Advisory Board event the previous evening.)
2. Contributions of career path stories (Ms. Rometty noted this was an opportunity to highlight one's company.)

Ms. Rometty also noted that this was an opportunity to highlight the Pledge to America's Workers.

Ms. Rometty then introduced Ann Rubin to present the concept of the marketing campaign in more detail.

### **Presentation by Ann Gould Rubin, Vice-President, Corporate Marketing, IBM**

Ms. Rubin noted that advertising can be a compelling way to change even deep-seated perceptions. She noted its use to address systemic societal issues like the opioid crisis or bullying, or perceptions around illnesses and disorders, such as autism. She remarked that it could both change perceptions and cause people to act.

To change people's perceptions regarding pathways to success, Ms. Rubin indicated a need to educate the target audience by:

1. Creating awareness that there are in fact multiple pathways available to getting good-paying jobs and to achieve career success
2. Changing perceptions so the target audience understands that the alternate pathways can result in fulfillment and success and that they are very rewarding

Ms. Rubin then outlined initial thoughts—prepared by IBM—on what a national campaign could look like. These included:

- Advertising that would likely run on TV, social media, and websites, and maybe radio or outdoor
- A big national campaign
- Would likely consist of compelling, inspiring stories of real people who have succeeded with alternate pathways
- A very inspirational, action-oriented landing page or digital experience, somewhere the target audience could go to get more information and learn what to do next

Ms. Rubin noted that—on its own—IBM has initiated some research to gain insights into how to reach the target audiences. They anticipate the research will be completed in the near term. They are looking at motivations, drivers, interests, barriers, and reactions to descriptions of pathways. The two target audiences of this research are:

- Youth aged 16 to 20, and importantly, their parents
- Mid-career jobseekers—that is, people who have left the workforce and want to come back or people who are re-skilling, up-skilling, and/or changing jobs

When the research is complete, they anticipate the next actions will include:

- Together as a group, exploring creative content

- Working with agencies
- Production
- Creation of the landing experience
- Development of an influencer marketing plan
- Development of a public relations plan
- Monitoring the campaign and fine-tuning, as necessary

Ms. Rubin indicated that such a campaign could be ready to launch in January, if approved. She then described a prototype of an interactive landing page that could be developed if the campaign were to launch. This prototype included:

- A question to separate the two target audiences—e.g., “I’m a student” or I’m ready for a career change”
- Examples of possibilities included a quiz that leads the participant to information about pathways aligned with their answers. It might also lead to real-world stories, illustrating pathways like apprenticeships and providing information, such as the median salaries of jobs.
- Resources about vocational schools or online learning opportunities

Ms. Rubin remarked that an effective way to move forward would be to seek to partner with the non-profit Ad Council. She noted the “She Can STEM” campaign and other public service campaigns associated with the Ad Council. She identified the key benefit of such a partnership is that the Ad Council receives donations of free media from TV stations, websites, all kinds of publications, outdoor companies, and radio stations for use in public service campaigns. Ms. Rubin remarked that, although there are other costs to conducting a campaign, media is the most costly. When that’s donated, that’s a win.

Ms. Rubin summarized the recommendations being put forth for approval as a privately funded campaign working with outside organizations, such as agencies and the Ad Council, that consists of advertising, influencer campaign, marketing, and a landing page.

Ms. Rometty added that the Ad Council had already agreed to a partnership for the proposed campaign.

## **Board Discussion**

Ms. Trump remarked that there is a tremendous lack of knowledge about the skills needed to fill the vacant jobs in America today across so many different industries. She noted the dual focus, highlighting the importance of thinking about the mid-to late-career worker who needs to learn a new skill to learn a new job or to learn a new skill to do the same job that they are currently doing today. She also appreciated the focus on the upcoming generation and allowing people to make smart decisions based on their passions and priorities. She then opened the meeting to discussion by the Board members.

Ms. Humpton remarked that the working group she co-chairs would later make a presentation on encouraging employers to engage and demonstrating the return on investment, noting that the same voice that speaks to prospective employees is going to be incredibly valuable for employers. She indicated full support for the recommendation.

Mr. Taylor remarked that there are challenges in using the labels “student” and “mid-career.” He noted that work done at SHRM suggests that the term “mid-career” often only resonates with workers who are in career-oriented fields, for example engineers. For people who have never been in career-oriented fields, the term does not connect. He also noted that the average age of their “student” membership was 33 years old. He gave the example that an MBA student would self-identify as a student.

Ms. Rometty agreed that finishing the research to get the wording and the labels right was important. She indicated they would follow up with SHRM.

Mr. McGarvey commented that providing information about the economic trajectory of the occupation would be important. He gave the example of the importance of understanding the career path for women in trade professions. He noted that women early in their careers may also be starting families—childcare, transportation, and other factors may be challenging. He described the importance of providing information about how workers in a given field may need a little help in the beginning, but later on will likely reach an economic level at which they can rely on themselves and not need outside help. For example, in the construction industries, once you learn the skill set you can become an entrepreneur. You work with all these family businesses, he said, that start with a tradesperson—or tradeswoman—and they get through and get a certain amount of expertise and they say, “I want to be in business.” He indicated the importance of providing information about the income trajectory, in addition the current medium income.

Ms. Rometty requested an immediate vote on the recommendations. The Board co-chairs indicated the Board would vote on this working party’s recommendations since Ms. Rometty might have to leave a few minutes early. The remainder of the voting would take place at the end of the meeting.

## Vote on the recommendation of the Working Group to Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success

Recommendation

1. **Develop a private sector-led national campaign to raise awareness of and promote multiple pathways to well-paying jobs for all Americans.**

The Board approved the working group recommendations through a voice vote.

## Working Group to Increase Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs

**Increase Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs**

**Co-chairs**  
Eric Holcomb, Governor of Indiana  
Bill McDermott, CEO, SAP

**Members**  
Jay Box, President, Kentucky Community & Technical College System  
Michael Piwowar, Executive Director, Milken Institute  
Jay Timmons, President & CEO, National Association of Manufacturers  
Scott Sanders, Executive Director, National Association of State Workforce Agencies  
Juanita Duggan, President & CEO, National Federation for Independent Business  
Marianne Wanamaker, Professor, University of Tennessee  
Thomas J. Donohue, CEO, U.S. Chamber of Commerce  
Doug McMillon, Chairman, President & CEO, Walmart  
Scott Pulsipher, President, Western Governors University

Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

**Increase Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs**

**Focus Areas**

- 1 Support the development of a **flexible skills-based ontology** and structured, living taxonomies to create an adaptable common data foundation (Develop recommendations to modernize O\*Net).
- 2 Develop a trusted system for **sharing** aggregate and individual **workforce data**.

Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

**Data Transparency Working Group Key Priorities**  
We Are Focused on Delivering Three Key Wins

- 1 Build on existing efforts to improve skills-based ontologies** so diverse data assets can speak a common, machine-readable language that helps us understand the skills needed today and anticipate the skills of the future.
- 2 Develop consensus to create an interoperable digital learning record** that includes traditional education attainment, non-traditional learning pathways, experience, professional affiliations, and other certifications to help job seekers attain high-wage jobs.
- 3 Break down data-sharing barriers** to create a robust, real-time data foundation to spur workforce innovation.



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

**Data Transparency Working Group**  
Interoperable Learning Records White Paper Overview

**What is an interoperable learning record (ILR)**

- An ILR is a system that contains, and can manage communication of, credentials that describe an individual's skills and achievements.
- The potential audience for ILRs in the United States is enormous — 160+ million earners, more than six million employers, 700,000+ unique credentials offered, 23,000+ apprenticeship programs, and 7,000+ institutions of higher education.

**How will an ILR make a difference in the career journey of an American worker**

- Unlike resumes, ILRs can provide a common approach to creating, maintaining and sharing skill-related credentials and validation of learning — whether it's formal or informal, in-person or online, certification exams, single courses or full programs, discovery-based or training experiences, manager feedback or formal performance reviews, community-based library activities or non-profit experiences, and more.
- As a result, American workers would be able to share ILRs with employers to attain the best jobs that more directly match their skill sets.

**What is the purpose behind our ILR white paper**

- The Interoperable Learning Records (ILR) white paper lays the first cornerstones for the development of tools that will enable adoption of ILRs across the U.S. education and workforce ecosystems.
- We included an overview of the key ILR terminology, the ILR ecosystem as well as lay out the core protocols that the system would require.
- The White Paper provides three recommendations for consideration by the American Workforce Policy Advisory Board for moving forward with demonstrating the viability of the ILR ecosystem and towards scalable ILR implementation.



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

Ms. Trump asked Governor Holcomb and Mr. McDermott to begin their presentation.

### Remarks by Working Group Co-Chairs Governor Eric Holcomb and Mr. Bill McDermott,

Governor Holcomb thanked the co-chairs, the host, Mr. Clark, and his co-chair Mr. McDermott. He noted that Mr. McDermott would discuss the [white paper](#) the working group had produced about interoperable learning records (ILRs). He began by noting that the working group had focused their attention primarily on three fronts:

1. Making sure that we were breaking down the workforce data sharing barriers
2. Building a workforce record that accurately describes someone's skillsets, their experiences, and their insights and instincts, something that properly captures the whole evolution of someone's path and
3. Improving skills-based occupational ontology

All of these topics he indicated were considered in the working group's recommendations for ILRs.

Governor Holcomb then described a number of State of Indiana initiatives related to the proposed ILRs, including:

- Use of e-transcripts in all of Indiana's high schools; he described these as data files that meet all the national and open standards and that can be forwarded throughout someone's career
- Extension of e-transcripts to post-secondary institutions in Indiana
- Scaled up work with [Credential Engine](#)
- Aligning competencies at public institutions across 30 credit hours of core course work via Indiana's state-wide transfer general education core program
- Aligning other competencies across Indiana's next-level jobs program to get resources directly to the employers and to the employees.

Governor Holcomb highlighted the success of these initiatives, then posed the question, "What's next?"

Mr. McDermott noted that ILRs were a use of technology to better understand the skills gap that exists in the economy that is inhibiting the progress of the American worker. He described it a way to communicate skills among workers, employers, and training institutions, so we have a single source of the truth.

Mr. McDermott indicated they were presenting a white paper that would offer all the key milestones in the working groups effort and give a clear guide to the development and the adoption of the ILRs.

He noted it builds trust and trust is the ultimate human currency. He noted it could be used as a tool to increase diversity and gender equality.

He described how with experience data on top of the ILR we can further predict where we need to go in the future because we are no longer relying on the databases of the past. We are using deep machine learning and artificial intelligence, and essentially forming a block chain with data that everybody can believe in and trust.

Mr. McDermott then introduced SAP data scientist, Kian Kamyab, to further describe the ILR.

### **Presentation by Kian Kamyab, Data Scientist, SAP.iO Venture Studio, SAP**

Mr. Kamyab described skills-driven matching of people to jobs as one way we can help all Americans maximize their potential. He noted that currently, there is a lot of friction in the matching process.

Mr. Kamyab illustrated the friction in the matching process by describing the career path of a fictional worker, “Olivia.” The comparison illustrates that Olivia’s ability to understand the options open to her and the ease with which she can document her education, training, skills, and experience for current and potential employers worked more efficiently and effectively with an ILR system in place.

He noted the value of a system that could help workers map and navigate the 738,428 credentials<sup>1</sup> in the United States. He described the idea as:

- A map that identifies which credentials are related to which skills and which skills are related to which jobs (an ontology)
- A set of protocols, serving a function like those that make internet browsing a common experience regardless of the computer you use or the browser you prefer
- Data from across the silos of federal, state, and local governments, the private sector and educational institutions

He indicated that on this foundation, tools could be built that would empower Americans to navigate the complex web connecting credentials, skills, and jobs. He described how the framework for these tools already exists. These are the technologies, he said, that deliver effective movie recommendations and the technology that allows one to have a digital boarding pass to board an airplane. He noted that on top of a foundation of an ILR ecosystem these technological tools can be used to point Americans to the next stepping stone in their professional journey and can be used to let them own a record of that journey that employers can trust.

### **Board Discussion**

Ms. Trump opened the discussion to the Board Members.

Mr. Bumphus raised the question of whether the target audience would understand the terminology—that is, ILRs. He noted that once you read about it, it makes sense, but the term is a challenge.

Governor Holcomb noted they had discussed it and acknowledged that words matter. They’ve got to connect with the people—people who don’t necessarily have a high school diploma or the equivalency

---

<sup>1</sup> Source: Credential Engine.

of one. He indicated that how the Board communicates this will need to change. Furthermore, he offered to host a future meeting to demonstrate a working prototype.

Board members offered ideas of terminology, including “shared learning record” and “boarding pass.” Ms. Trump indicated the Board should get suggestions from everyone. She noted the potential of everyone having these tools at their fingertips. She described this as the resumé of the future and posed the question: What’s the name of the future? She indicated this would be discussed at the next meeting.

Ms. Duggan noted that such a system needs to work for small businesses—where the owner is typically stretched thin doing everything—as well as for big businesses.

Ms. Trump thanked the members for their contributions and then turned the floor over to the next working group.

## Working Group to Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices

**Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices**

**Co-chairs**  
Johnny C. Taylor, Jr., President & CEO, Society for Human Resource Management  
Al Kelly, Chairman & CEO, Visa

**Members**  
Walter Bumphus, President & CEO, American Association of Community Colleges  
Kim Reynolds, Governor, State of Iowa  
Craig Menear, Chairman, President, & CEO, The Home Depot  
Ginni Rometty, Chairman, President, & CEO, IBM  
Scott Sanders, Executive Director, National Association of State Workforce Agencies  
Thomas J. Donohue, CEO, U.S. Chamber of Commerce  
Sheree Utash, President, Wichita State Technical University



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

**Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices**

**Goal 1: Provide Employers, Job Seekers, and Policymakers with the Tools Needed to Better Identify Job Openings by State**  
State-specific job vacancy data will better enable efforts to move individuals from the sidelines and into in-demand occupations.

**Recommendation 1**  
**Permanently Extend the Bureau of Labor Statistics Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey Experimental State Data Project.**  
In recognizing the importance of this survey, the National Council for the American Worker should ensure the prioritization of this work within BLS. In addition, the Advisory Board encourages Congress to support this work and provide additional resources as appropriate.

27

**Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices**

**Goal 2: Improve Availability and Usability of Education and Labor Market Data for Job Creators.**  
A central repository and improved coordination of state and federal labor market, employment, and education data will better enable employers to hire based on skills.

**Recommendations 2 & 3**

**Publish a Single Inventory of Labor Market and Education Data Housed on a Central Website.**  
This data should reflect both the current and potential labor force, including underutilized and disconnected working-age individuals. The Departments of Labor and Education should better coordinate and update more frequently Labor’s Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) system and Education’s Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes to allow better alignment of education programming with actual labor market needs.

**Produce Regular State and Local Area Reports that Provide Labor Force Information Similar to the “Employment Situation” Report.**  
The Bureau of Labor Statistics, Census Bureau, Institute of Education Sciences, and other agencies should collaborate on these reports. The reports should include labor force status by sex, age, race, ethnicity, nativity, disability status, and veteran status as well as data on persons not in the labor force.

30

**Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices**

**Goal 3: Increase On-Ramps to Employment by Optimizing the Talent of All Americans**  
Improve labor market outcomes for untapped populations by realizing the full potential of Opportunity Zones.

31

## Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices

### Recommendations 4 & 5

#### Create an Opportunity Zone Workforce Development Playbook.

The federal government, along with state and local counterparts and key experts, should create a framework for communities to ensure a strong correlation between workforce development and economic development. As part of this framework, there should be a focus on scalable entrepreneurship, apprenticeship expansion, and accelerating growing companies.

#### Align Funding and Prioritize Outcomes.

Federal, state, and local governments should prioritize existing workforce development activities, including scholarships at postsecondary institutions, towards those residing in Opportunity Zones. This can be done through competitive preferences in awarding grants or states incentivizing companies and organizations to up-skill and re-skill residents in these areas. These funds should be designed to focus on outcomes and performance with the goal of providing a return on the investments made from public or private sources. These activities should also be rigorously evaluated to replicate the most effective strategies for helping those on the sidelines to gain and retain employment.

35

## Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices

### Recommendation 6

#### Urge Corporate and Philanthropic Investment.

Companies in similar industries, especially those facing workforce shortages and skills gaps, should invest in distressed communities, which may include the use of unrealized capital gains in an Opportunity Fund targeted toward workforce development. Foundations should also be encouraged to invest in these communities to scale these investments.

36

## Remarks by Working Group Co-Chairs Mr. Johnny C. Taylor, Jr. and Mr. Al Kelly

Mr. Taylor began by recalling the goal discussed at the previous meeting— improve labor force participation and helping unemployed workers. (That is, unemployed workers and those people who are no longer looking for a job.) He described the underlying problem as both a labor shortage and a skills shortage. He indicated that to address these issues, we need to know:

- Who is on the sidelines?
- Why they are on the sidelines?
- Where are they located?

Mr. Taylor indicated the working group was committed to:

- Better identifying the underutilized talent pools
- Targeting their education and skills training
- Then, optimizing the linkage to them wherever they are

He indicated that in developing the recommendations the working group was presenting, they had focused on consolidating labor market information at federal and state agencies. He indicated Mr. Kelly would speak to the gaps. He noted they had met with the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Commissioner and the president of the Economic Innovation Group, a group that rethinks economic development.

Mr. Taylor noted the importance of tying workforce development and economic development together and noted that he would be talking about Opportunity Zones later in the presentation.

Mr. Kelly highlighted the value of turning data into insights. The first recommendations, he noted, are focused on data. He said they found that there is a lot of data and shared some statistics from the BLS [Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey](#) (JOLTS).

He noted that BLS had recently begun producing state-level data. The working group's first recommendation, he said, is to ask BLS to push this work to the next level with the goal of finding all of the insights we can possibly get out of this data, including its limitations. Specifically, they mean to:

- As they look at the JOLTS data set, determine how granular can they really get
- Make the data more accessible and more useful on a day-in-and-day-out basis

- Refresh the job categories so that they are more representative of today's job categories, as well as the job categories of the future

The second recommendation is to look at the state-level data. At the state level there is all kinds of data. The core of the second recommendation, he said, is that we ask the Department of Labor and the Department of Education to come together and try to aggregate all of this data from around the country—the 50 states and the District of Columbia.

Mr. Taylor described the final recommendation of the working group as increasing onramps to employment through a focus on Opportunity Zones. The Opportunity Zones have been identified. Governors are all up and running trying to tie the opportunities with the people who want the opportunities. That's what this is, he said, a Match.com from an economic development standpoint.

Mr. Taylor noted that he serves as the president's chairman on the Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU) initiatives. He continued that half of the country's HBCUs are in Opportunity Zones and they are excited about providing more opportunity for people in those communities. He also highlighted the statistics about the high number of prime age adults in Opportunity Zones who are not working.

Information about Opportunity Zones, he noted, helps create better partnerships—public-private partnerships and partnerships between higher education institutions and employers.

Mr. Taylor described three recommendations, which are:

- Develop a playbook, that is, the Federal Government—along with state and local government—should create a framework as they examine how to develop entrepreneurship opportunities, expand apprenticeships and accelerate growing companies.
- Prioritize existing federal funding for workforce development activities and align the funding to enhance the growth opportunities associated with Opportunity Zones.
- Encourage corporate and philanthropic investment in Opportunity Zones.

Mr. Kelly closed the presentation by describing the next steps for the working group and highlighting the linkages between the work being done in each of the working groups.

Next steps included focusing on best practices in terms of talent recruitment, hiring, and training, and figuring out how to encourage skills-based hiring practices that enable workers and potential employers to come together and try to match skills with jobs. Additional questions included:

- What will job postings of the future look like?
- How can candidates prepare a resumé for the future (linking this effort to the work on ILRs)?
- How can AI help us in this space?

## **Board Discussion**

Ms. Trump opened the floor for discussion by the Board Members.

Mr. Piwowar remarked that he was heartened to see the recommendations regarding Opportunity Zones. He commented that the Milken Institute was spending a lot of time trying to make sure the initiative works as intended to get capital to job creators in underserved and fragile areas.

The Milken Institute, he noted, has partnered with the White House, the Department of Commerce, the Department of Housing and Urban Development, and state governors to have some events around the country to raise awareness about Opportunity Zones. He indicated they were also doing a boot camp

with state and local officials and other people to develop ideas and a playbook. These, he remarked, dovetail with this working group's recommendations.

Ms. Trump noted the link between capital coming into underserved communities and the expected result of local job creation. We want to facilitate and encourage that, she indicated, as well as encouraging training to make sure the workforce has the skills they need.

Ms. Trump remarked that the effort to re-envision and modernize workforce data was very exciting. She called on the Governors and Mayor Lyles to comment about the opportunity—not only to make permanent the state level data push. She listed additional ideas including:

- A federal-level pilot to organize data that will be utilized or applied by the states, or
- Have the states take a survey about what is being done at the state level and make that information available to every other state to opt in to help us make the connection

Governor Holcomb remarked that Indiana was not waiting. "We're doing it. We've got 108K unfilled jobs right now in five key sectors and we know where they are and that is our goal every day to connect the people in the five key sectors with the skillsets that they need to fill those jobs."

Governor Reynolds noted that Iowa has a phone app on the workforce statistics which are updated daily. She also remarked that there was a need to align with the Federal Government and commented on the value of streamlining the process of pulling data from the BLS. She indicated there could be value in coordinating with other states and synching more coherently with the Federal Government.

Ms. Trump asked for views on whether governors in general would appreciate a survey to uncover the best examples and potential ways to improve transparency and possibly aggregate up and feed into the national system.

Mayor Lyles remarked that the idea around the Opportunity Zones for urban areas is very important. She noted that people who live in Opportunity Zones fear that they won't be able to stay. This, she indicated, was an issue that needed to be addressed. She indicated that an Opportunity Zone playbook was needed, indicating that it was a great recommendation. She also thanked Mr. Piwowar for the Milken Institute's efforts.

Mr. Taylor noted that he and Mr. Kelly had gone through information for 3 to 4 states and the states were using different languages and different metrics. He noted the value of a common language and rubric across states in companies that are trying to figure out where to locate their businesses.

Ms. Trump noted the need for another ontology.

# Working Group to Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Co-chairs**  
 Barbara Humpton, CEO, Siemens USA  
 Mike Pivowar, Executive Director, Milliken Institute

**Members**  
 Jim Clark, President & CEO, Boys & Girls Clubs of America  
 Elizabeth Goettl, President & CEO, Cristo Rey Network  
 Marilyn Hewson, Chairman, President & CEO, Lockheed Martin  
 Al Kelly, Chairman & CEO, Visa  
 Bill McDermott, CEO, SAP  
 Sean McGarvey, President, North America's Building Trades Unions  
 Johnny C. Taylor, Jr., President & CEO, Society for Human Resource Management  
 Jay Timmons, President & CEO, National Association of Manufacturers  
 Marianne Wanamaker, Professor, University of Tennessee



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Focus Areas**

- 1 Create a plan to institutionalize the Pledge to America's Workers in order to expand and enrich this initiative to highlight employers' investment in worker education and training.
- 2 Develop recommendations on national measures of employer-led training to quantify the impact of training, show the value to employees, and reveal the true value to the bottom line.



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Goals**

- 1 Expand the scope and functionality of the Pledge to America's Worker
- 2 Create a common framework for classifying training investments
- 3 Prioritize the collection of national data on employer-provided skill-based training



Better prepare the American workforce to meet 21st century challenges

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Recommendation 1**

Enhance the scope and functionality of the Pledge to America's Workers website to make the initiative a true worker- and employer-focused campaign by:

- Adding content about the training programs
- Showcasing the conversion of the Pledges into realized training opportunities through company video storytelling
- Hyper-linking to the Pledge company website landing page where the skill-based training is discussed
- Incorporating a map of the United States that indicates the location of the main types of training taking place across the country

40

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Recommendation 2**

The National Council for the American Worker should adopt the American Workforce Policy Advisory Board's definition of skill-based training and promote its adoption by federal government agencies and industry.

**Skill-Based Training:** Activities, programs, or events offered by employers that provide employees with the necessary knowledge, technical skills, and professional skills

- 1) to perform and stay up-to-date in their current job roles and
- 2) to be able to perform future job roles or enter other professions

41

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Recommendation 2**

**Skills-Based Training Definition**

<p><b>Includes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Initial skill training</li> <li>• Job maintenance training</li> <li>• Up-skilling training</li> <li>• Employee development</li> </ul>	<p><b>Excludes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Compliance training</li> <li>• Onboarding training</li> <li>• Informal learning</li> </ul>
--	---

42

## Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

**Recommendation 3**

Federal statistical agencies—principally the Census Bureau and Bureau of Labor Statistics—and industry and trade groups should prioritize the collection of five major categories of data on employer-provided skill-based training:

1. Incidence of skill-based training
2. Intensity of skill-based training
3. Key demographics of workers trained
4. Financial metrics of firms
5. Productivity gains for trained workers/training firms

43

Ms. Trump, then turned to the presentation by the co-chairs of the fourth working group.

### **Remarks by Working Group Co-Chairs Michael Piwowar, Executive Director, Milken Institute and Ms. Barbara Humpton, CEO of Siemens USA**

Mr. Piwowar noted that the theme of creating ontologies was in every presentation and it was very important. He reminded the Board that this working group was focused on increasing awareness of, and providing better information about, employer training investments. Specifically, the group was concentrating on three goals:

1. Expanding and enhancing the scope of the Pledge to America's Workers
2. Creating a common framework for classifying training investments
3. Prioritizing the collection of national data on employer-provided skills-based training

He offered a recommendation for each goal. He described the first recommendation as expanding and enhancing the scope of the Pledge to America's Workers website, which included:

- Adding content on training programs such as listing types of pledges according to an accepted definition of skill-based training
- Showcasing the pledges to real training opportunities through company video storytelling, which will already be done to the multiple pathways' website; hyperlinking where appropriate to pledge company landing pages where skills-based training is discussed and incorporating a map of the United States that indicates the geographic location and where the main types of training are taking place across the country

Ms. Humpton provided thoughts about how her company, Siemens USA, would take advantage of this recommendation. She remarked that they have learned at Siemens that using employee voices is one of the best ways of telling the stories the Board has been talking about. People are drawn in by contact with real people who have experienced these kinds of changes.

She also noted the opportunity to highlight lifelong learning. It's an opportunity to support overall career development, that is, to build into the Pledge the concept of "Own Your Career." She linked this concept with the ILR through the idea of a "boarding pass to opportunity."

Mr. Piwowar then provided a preview of where the working group would head if the Board adopted our recommendations today on the scope and functionality of the Pledge. He indicated that the next steps would involve the sustainability of the Pledge; that is, where would we want it to live and who would be responsible for it? He noted that the working group had preliminary discussions that suggested a private sector organization—either on its own or in a partnership with a federal agency—is probably best positioned to ensure that long-term sustainability. However, the working group would continue those discussions and hopefully have something formal to present at the next Board meeting.

Mr. Piwowar indicated the second recommendation was creating an ontology; that is, a standard definition for classifying training investments. He noted there were two parts to the recommendation, requiring the Board to:

- Adopt a specific definition of job-based skills training
- Recommend that the National Council of the American Worker adopt this definition and promote adoption by federal agencies and industry

The recommended definition is:

*Skill-Based Training: Activities, programs, or events offered by employers that provide employees with the necessary knowledge, technical skills, and professional skills to perform and stay up-to-date in their current job roles and to be able to perform future job roles or enter other professions.*

He thanked Mr. Taylor and his team at the Society for Human Resource Management for work that laid the foundation for this recommendation. He reiterated the SHRM survey results that revealed that:

- The majority of employers—small and large—offer skills training and track employee participation.
- More than half of the survey respondents also track financial and indirect costs of all kinds of skills training and development programs.
- However, employers lack a cohesive and consistent framework for categorizing the training that they provide.

He noted that this impedes the ability of employers, employees, trade associations, statistical agencies, academic researchers and other interested groups to accurately and comprehensively analyze the effectiveness of skills-based training. He indicated that the working group thought it was important to include current jobs and the ability to up-skill and go into new jobs and other professions.

Mr. Piwowar remarked that the third recommendation was based on the goal of prioritizing the collection of national data. He noted that voluntary, self-reported metrics were unlikely to give an accurate picture of economy-wide training efforts. Our working group, he said, had been examining mechanisms to collect such data nationally, including for the federal statistical system, which had implemented training-related surveys in the past.

The third recommendation he noted was to understand what to collect (before trying to figure out how to collect this data). The formal recommendation was that:

- The federal statistical agencies, principally the Census Bureau and BLS, and industry trade groups, should prioritize those five major categories on employer-provided skills-based training.

He thanked SHRM and Professor Marianne Wanamaker, who did considerable work to help pare down the key necessary and sufficient types of information that they needed. He noted that five are listed and that the working group sought to balance both the cost and the benefits of trying to collect this data.

On the cost side, he noted, was the burden it would place on companies. It would require filling out surveys and similar tasks. On the other side, he noted the desire to make sure there was sufficient data to try to calculate the effectiveness, efficiency and even the return on investment for various types of skills-based training.

Ms. Humpton commented that this effort was central to the dialogue taking place about business today; that is, to truly understand how business actions as job creators and the work they do to empower employees contribute to business financial success. She noted this becomes a virtuous cycle that helps drive growth for the economy at large.

Mr. Piwowar commented that the next steps would be to look at how to collect these data should the Board approve the recommendations. He indicated that understanding exactly what we're focusing on in terms of surveys and other data collection efforts would be necessary. Could questions be incrementally added to existing surveys? Would it have to be something new? He noted that this would be something the working group hoped to present at the next Board meeting.

## Board Discussion

Secretary Ross commented that since the Census Bureau was part of Commerce, the Commerce Department would try to do those five items.

Mr. Pulsipher asked whether how to measure and validate acquired competencies had been contemplated so that they get to be integrated into the “wallet” and be transferable. That is, what is the employers’ version of accreditation?

Ms. Humpton noted that companies like Lockheed Martin are doing extensive work in this area. She noted that the present discussion could raise the bar for companies. She noted that companies have typically looked at training from an internal perspective and not necessarily at the power of creating credentials that were recognized. She noted that at Siemens they’ve recognized the importance of the portable credential that their employees receive as a result of their participation in the apprenticeship program.

Mr. Donohue offered two closing comments:

1. With respect to all of the data issues the Board was considering addressing, he urged the Board to prototype solutions—working with the Federal Government and some number of states and local governments, and private-sector entities—before attempting to get the whole Federal Government to act.
2. With respect to job training, he indicated that the U.S. Chamber of Commerce and the National Association of Manufacturers could likely assist in getting some of the data.

Mr. Donohue also cautioned against trying to get the federal agencies to put all their data records and issues together.

## III. VOTE ON RECOMMENDATIONS

Ms. Trump called for a vote on the recommendations of the last three working groups. She noted that that Walmart, Apple, and Home Depot—who’s representatives were not in attendance—had submitted affirmative votes on all four sets of recommendations.

Ms. Trump called the working groups in order:

### **Vote on the recommendations of the Working Group to Increase Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs**

Recommendations:

1. **The National Council for the American Worker should create an ILR inventory of projects and initiatives that are currently underway or planned for the near future.**
2. **The National Council should convene an expert group who will develop an ILR project plan that clarifies stakeholders’ roles and incentives to both consume and issue credentials through ILRs.**
3. **The National Council should champion fast-track prototyping among stakeholders in the ILR ecosystem to quickly bring an ILR Minimum Viable Product (MVP) to market.**

The Board approved the working group recommendations through a voice vote.

## **Vote on the recommendations of the Report of the Working Group to Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices**

Recommendations:

### **1. Permanently extend the Bureau of Labor Statistics Job Openings and Labor Turnover Survey Experimental State Data Project.**

In recognizing the importance of this survey, the National Council for the American Worker should ensure the prioritization of this work within BLS. In addition, the Advisory Board encourages Congress to support this work and provide additional resources as appropriate.

### **2. Publish a single inventory of labor market and education data housed on a central website.**

This data should reflect both the current and potential labor force, including underutilized and disconnected working-age individuals. The Departments of Labor and Education should better coordinate and update more frequently Labor's Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) system and Education's Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes to allow better alignment of education programming with actual labor market needs.

### **3. Produce regular state and local area reports that provide labor force information similar to the "Employment Situation" Report.**

The Bureau of Labor Statistics, Census Bureau, Institute of Education Sciences, and other agencies should collaborate on these reports. The reports should include labor force status by sex, age, race, ethnicity, nativity, disability status, and veteran status as well as data on persons not in the labor force.

### **4. Create an Opportunity Zone workforce development playbook.**

The federal government, along with state and local counterparts and key experts, should create a framework for communities to ensure a strong correlation between workforce development and economic development. As part of this framework, there should be a focus on scalable entrepreneurship, apprenticeship expansion, and accelerating growing companies.

### **5. Align funding and prioritize outcomes.**

Federal, state, and local governments should prioritize existing workforce development activities, including scholarships at postsecondary institutions, towards those residing in Opportunity Zones. This can be done through competitive preferences in awarding grants or states incentivizing companies and organizations to up-skill and re-skill residents in these areas. These funds should be designed to focus on outcomes and performance with the goal of providing a return on the investments made from public or private sources. These activities should also be rigorously evaluated to replicate the most effective strategies for helping those on the sidelines to gain and retain employment.

### **6. Urge corporate and philanthropic investment.**

Companies in similar industries, especially those facing workforce shortages and skills gaps, should invest in distressed communities, which may include the use of unrealized capital gains in an Opportunity Fund targeted toward workforce development. Foundations should also be encouraged to invest in these communities to scale these investments.

The Board approved the working group recommendations through a voice vote.

## Vote on the recommendations of the Working Group to Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments

Recommendations:

**1. Enhance the scope and functionality of the Pledge to America’s Workers website to make the initiative a true worker- and employer-focused campaign by:**

- Adding content about the training programs
- Showcasing the conversion of the Pledges into realized training opportunities through company video storytelling
- Hyperlinking to the Pledge company website landing page, where the skill-based training is discussed
- Incorporating a map of the United States that indicates the location of the main types of training taking place across the country

**2. The National Council for the American Worker should adopt the American Workforce Policy Advisory Board’s definition of skill-based training and promote its adoption by federal government agencies and industry.**

<p><b>Skill-Based Training:</b> Activities, programs, or events offered by employers that provide employees with the necessary knowledge, technical skills, and professional skills:</p> <p>1) to perform and stay up-to-date in their current job roles and                  2) to be able to perform future job roles or enter other professions</p>	
<p><b>Includes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Initial skill training</li> <li>• Job maintenance training</li> <li>• Up-skilling training</li> <li>• Employee development</li> </ul>	<p><b>Excludes:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Compliance training</li> <li>• Onboarding training</li> <li>• Informal learning</li> </ul>

**3. Federal statistical agencies—principally the Census Bureau and Bureau of Labor Statistics—and industry and trade groups should prioritize the collection of five major categories of data on employer-provided skill-based training:**

1. Incidence of skill-based training
2. Intensity of skill-based training
3. Key demographics of workers trained
4. Financial metrics of firms
5. Productivity gains for trained workers/training firms

The Board approved the working group recommendations through a voice vote.

#### IV. CLOSING

Secretary Ross and Ms. Trump thanked the Board members. The meeting adjourned at 11:07 a.m. (EDT)

#### V. MATERIALS PROVIDED TO THE BOARD MEMBERS

The following materials were provided to the Board members at the meeting:

1. [Agenda](#)
2. [Discussion Slides](#)
3. Working Group Recommendations
  - [Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success](#)
  - [Increase Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs](#)
  - [Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices](#)
  - [Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training Investments](#)
4. [Interoperable Learning Records White Paper](#)
5. [Member Biographies](#) (updated)
6. [Charter for the Advisory Board \(Amended 5/3/2019\)](#)

[Public comments](#) were provided to the Board Members by email prior to the meeting and are available on the [American Workforce Policy Advisory Board website](#).

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing minutes are accurate and complete.

---

Sabrina L. Montes, Designated Federal Official  
Office of the Director  
Bureau of Economic Analysis  
U.S. Department of Commerce

---

Date