

**Formal Meeting Minutes**  
**March 6, 2019**



**Call to Order**

The first meeting of the [American Workforce Policy Advisory Board](#) was held on March 6, 2019, in the White House State Dining Room. It began at 1:30 PM EST.

**Attendees**

**Members in attendance included:**

- Ivanka Trump: Advisor to the President, White House (co-chair)
- Wilbur Ross: Secretary, U.S. Department of Commerce (co-chair)
- Jay Box: President, Kentucky Community and Technical College System
- Walter Bumphus: President & CEO, American Association of Community Colleges
- Jim Clark: CEO, Boys & Girls Clubs of America
- Tim Cook: CEO, Apple
- Tom Donohue: CEO, US Chamber of Commerce
- Juanita Duggan: President & CEO, National Federation for Independent Business
- Elizabeth Goettl: President & CEO, Cristo Rey Network
- Marillyn Hewson: CEO, Lockheed Martin
- Eric Holcomb: Governor, Indiana
- Barbara Humpton: CEO, Siemens USA
- Al Kelly: CEO, Visa
- Vi Lyles: Mayor, Charlotte North Carolina
- Sean McGarvey: President, North America's Building and Trades Unions
- Craig Menear: Chairman & CEO, Home Depot
- Michael Piwowar: Executive Director, Milken Institute
- Scott Pulsipher: President, Western Governors University
- Kim Reynolds: Governor, Iowa
- Ginni Rometty: CEO, IBM
- Scott Sanders: Executive Director, National Association of State Workforce Agencies
- Johnny C. Taylor, Jr., President & CEO, SHRM - Society for Human Resource Management
- Jay Timmons: CEO, National Association of Manufacturers
- Sheree Utash: President, WSU Tech
- Marianne Wanamaker: Professor, University of Tennessee

**Members not in attendance included:**

- Bill McDermott: CEO, SAP America
- Doug McMillon: CEO, Walmart

Discussion began at 2:00 P.M.

**Ivanka Trump:** delivered opening remarks, provided statistics on the current U.S. workforce and spoke to the mission of the board.

- **Mission:** Ensure all Americans can benefit from the nation's historic economic boom and record low unemployment rates. We seek to bring more Americans off the sidelines and into the workforce by improving jobs data transparency and skills-based hiring and training, advancing opportunities for lifelong learning, and promoting multiple pathways to family-sustaining careers.

**Wilbur Ross:** [Welcome Remarks](#)

- Welcomed the board
- Discussed the current training systems in the U.S. are inadequate. Currently 7.3 million jobs need to be filled
- Emphasized through the executive order they should explore all pathways to filling jobs and getting employees correctly trained
- Announced the four main goals of the board:
  - Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success
  - Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs
  - Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices
  - Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training / Reskilling Investments

**Ivanka Trump:** Announced *Goal 1 - Develop a Campaign to Promote Multiple Pathways to Career Success*. Companies, workers, parents, and policymakers have traditionally assumed that a university degree is the best, or only, path to a middle-class career. Employers and job seekers should be aware of multiple career pathways and skill development opportunities outside of traditional 4-year degrees. There are multiple paths to grade-A jobs.

- Asked question to Ginni Rometty, "You announced the launch that will create thousands of new apprenticeships in 20 U.S. states and help close the skills gap companies face when hiring new employees. Why is IBM taking this step and can you share some ideas on how the board can accomplish its goal of creating and promoting multiple pathways?"

**Ginni Rometty:**

- Highlighted two main challenges ahead:
  - Technology will not just displace a percentage of jobs but will also change 100% of jobs
  - Deep rise of a "have and have not" exclusive economy

- Paradigms:
  - Accept career skills are important as diplomas
    - Fifteen percent of new jobs at IBM are “new collar” skills – a phrase for workers who have technology skills but not a four-year college degree
  - Need to offer multiple pathways to a good-paying job
- Answers:
  - Rescaling career people and positions
    - Apprenticeships are very successful
  - New models of education
    - 6-year high schools in affiliation with community colleges
  - Public policy changes to be made
    - Higher education act is a policy change
    - Expanding Pell Grants to non-fulltime students is recommended

**Ivanka Trump** – asked Tim Cook, you talked about rethinking education in this country as a life-long pursuit as opposed to how we traditionally thought about it as an upfront investment. Job requirements are constantly changing, and we anticipate that to be increasingly more rapid. How do you think we can change our culture to rethink this approach as part of the mission of this first goal to create an awareness campaign around these multiple pathways?

**Tim Cook:**

- Apple was founded by a college dropout – we have a core belief in the value of skills
- Nearly 50% of Apple new hires in 2018 did not have college degrees
- Education and employer needs are not aligned – need to find a way to marry them
- Largest job shortage is in coding – believes coding should be a core curriculum for all K-12 students – We have found that teachers are very receptive to this challenge and the push to modernize the classroom
- Apple designed a successful curriculum for a community college in Austin, TX
- Life is not all about STEM – Creativity matters
  - Discussed a program called “Everyone Can Create” that marries creativity skill with other courses
- Agrees with Ginny Rometty that Pell grants should be extended to programs outside of 4-year degree programs – signals that we value skills and education outside the traditional bachelor’s degree
- Biggest issue is getting government, private sector, and education to work together
- Recommends pushing initiatives at the local level and nurture them – noted that everyone loves to copy successful ideas and models
- Recognizes that AI skills are in very short supply
- Established Apple University and has invested millions in this initiative
- Signals we send to society matter – Federal and State funding is a big part of this

- Wants to increase diversity in tech – otherwise we will fail as an industry
- Research shows job descriptions are inadvertently written to be male oriented

**Ivanka Trump:** asked Jim Clark, as president of CEO of the Boys and Girls Club of America, you reach millions of young people at critical ages, in your opinion which is the best way to reach these young people and give them a plan and help give them exposure to these opportunities that are afforded to them?”

**Jim Clark:**

- The best way to partner with youth is to partner with schools
  - Kids spend more time out of school than in school
- The youth of today need to be met where they are and operate
  - Email is no longer effective with them
  - Atmosphere – where they are matters
  - Mentors and adult role models provide guidance and hope
- Recommends including an up upstream approach - 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> graders should be participating in this conversation
  - Kids need to be exposed in formative years, not later in life
- Success breeds success
- Kids need to learn essential skills such as customer service, conflict, communication, creativity, and innovation from 4<sup>th</sup> grade and up

**Ivanka Trump:** asked Sean McGarvey, last month the Department of Labor reported 52k new construction jobs were created. That is incredible. How can we increase awareness in careers in construction that are growing and well-paying industries that Americans and younger Americans maybe overlooking?

**Sean McGarvey:**

- College debt is forcing folks to look at alternatives to a 4- year degree
- We need to encourage high school students to come out to construction sites and participate in the cool jobs like operating drones
- Middle class are looking for trade jobs and a skill to last forever to sustain finances for family (live in the middle class comfortably)
  - Middle class is a secure place and we have to find a way to keep up skillsets with current employees and employers
- Family friendly policies are crucial

- Challenge:
  - Burdens such as daycare needs must be addressed
  - Help keep more women in trade – often times after they start a family they leave the trade business.
- We must find how to recruit and keep valuable employees
  - Requires resources and money
- Exposing high school students to training centers with hands on experience can help for later jobs and sustaining job

**Ivanka Trump:** asked Marillyn Hewson, Lockheed Martin announced \$100 million in training and education over 5 years and signing our pledge demonstrating a commitment to education and recalling workers. What prompted you to make that investment and more importantly how we can take investment and bring them to scale?

- The current workforce is at risk with continuing retirements
- Lockheed Martin hired 14,000 employees last year, half of which did not have a degree
- On-the-job training and apprenticeships are very effective
  - Expand workplace training and mid-career learning
  - More ways to get certifications to learn and grow
- Expand tuition reimbursement beyond traditional four-year programs
- Team with community colleges
- LM is investing \$50 million over 5 years in STEM scholarship programs
- We need to identify ways to incentivize industry through training grants

**Ivanka Trump:** asked Vi Lyles, I'd love to hear your observations and recommendations on how you're creating a match with job vacancies on a local level with your students?

**Vi Lyles:**

- Many students drop out in Charlotte before graduating high school
- There are multiple barriers for employment
  - Need to create a match in training with the job vacancies
  - Train in hard and soft skills (they're lacking)

- We need to address training in soft skills first. They can be as important or more important than hard skills
- Charlotte has implemented a program that guarantees a good paying job (\$15/hr. w/ benefits) which has been effective in getting people to a job.
- Apprentices are lacking and most people benefit from having them
- We need to put people to work and show them they can succeed
- Training should be incentivized by guaranteeing a good paying job

**Ivanka Trump:** turns floor over to Chris Liddell.

**Chris Liddell (White House Deputy Chief of Staff for Policy Coordination):** Announced *Goal 2: Data Transparency to Better Match American Workers with American Jobs*. High-quality, transparent, and timely data can significantly improve the ability of employers, students, job seekers, education providers, and policymakers to make informed choices about education and employment—especially for matching education and training programs to in-demand jobs and the skills needed to fill them.

- Asks Eric Holcomb, it was recently announced your state has launched Indiana together with the Markle Foundation, how do these efforts and others in your state help empower the labor market with user friendly data platforms and deliver more training with new technology?

**Eric Holcomb:**

- Our greatest assets are our people with unique experiences
- Industry would grow faster if we could provide employees for all the existing needs
  - To keep our top employees, we need money for training and new skill sets
- Need to learn to ask the right questions to fill jobs and on job announcements
- We are a lot closer to the year 2050 than 1950 – we must adapt for the future of manufacturing
- [Markle Foundation](#) success: started asking the right questions. Markle works to realize the potential of information technology to address previously intractable public problems for the economic security, health, and national security of all Americans.
- Private, government, and education sectors needs to steer together
- State Motivation: “We are #1 in manufacturing today, but we want to make sure we are #1 in manufacturing in the future.”

**Chris Liddell:** asks Tom Donohue, the Chamber of Commerce is doing a number of interesting initiatives in this area. Can you talk about the role that you see business having in modernizing workforce data? And how can employers and other stakeholders leverage this data to make smarter hiring decisions?

**Tom Donohue:**

- The current issue is a problem that should have a solution within itself:
  - Lots of people without jobs and lots of jobs without people
- We've hired most workers ready to go to work
- Need to tackle immigration because we are losing people on both ends
- We cannot expect Education to figure out all the needs that companies require – need to exchange jobs and education data
- There are six million people out of work frozen where they are
- [AFL-CIO](#) has education programs in place to qualify individuals for job training programs and eliminate earlier barriers
- We must find solutions to put people back to work. Match people with the need
- Give people second chances to succeed (i.e. Addicts, prisoners, etc.)
- Communication issue for educators to know what kind of people and skillsets companies need

**Chris Liddell:** asks Marianne Wanamaker, one of the most frequently requested data sets in industry is information that will help evaluate the rate of return of training investments. What can universities do to help provide more information on education outcome to help students make more informed decisions?

**Marianne Wanamaker:**

- Receives calls all the time from people asking where to find vacant jobs in their area but does not have data available to share – need to make data available
- Provide information for job opportunities.
  - Do a better job of providing information on returns for particular programs or degrees.
- Federal government and their data has to be involved to succeed.
- Examine transparency about what jobs lead to.
- College Scorecard is helpful.
- Census Bureau LEHD data product is a newer more helpful data set/tool.

**Chris Liddell:** asks Scott Sanders, there's a tremendous amount of public investment in workforce development initiatives across the state. What data can state-level workforce programs provide to effectively monitor and evaluate these programs?

**Scott Sanders:**

- We need data to find data

- [RESEA](#) – one-on-one counseling and career coaching
- Reemployment services coach those not in the market on how to get back into jobs
- Employers need those folks that want to learn and grow; they can provide the hard skills
- We need to look at whether machine reading for screening job applicants actually matches up skills to jobs from the resume
- Top five skills shortage according to LinkedIn
  - Oral communication
  - Business management
  - People management
  - Developmental tools
  - Basic leadership tools

**Chris Liddell:** asks Jay Box, as you oversee your courses and program offerings how does the Kentucky community technical college system incorporate data and meet the needs of employers?

**Jay Box:**

- Match jobs available in region and match up skill sets to help students qualify for these jobs
- Have jobs waiting for students and have them qualified prior to graduation

**Chris Liddell:** asks Scott Pulsipher, one of the unique elements of the Western Governors approach is your competency model for assessment as an institution that is implementing competency-based assessment at scale, do you see a role for that data in the future of workforce development?

**Scott Pulsipher:**

- Yes, we continue to grow at 20%
- Help students find out what degree or skill set they need or want to get
- The best way to interpret data for a job seeker is through on-on-one coaching
- Education institutions need to define learning outcomes to a lifelong model
- 35-40% gap in skills from what candidates think they are qualified for versus what employers think
- Cited the LinkedIn study of biggest barriers to employment: all soft skills
- Issues:



- Resumes often read by machines but folks don't know how to write resumes that will get them past the machines although they may be qualified
- Job postings are not written correctly

**Ivanka Trump:** Announced *Goal 3: Modernize Candidate Recruitment and Training Practices*. Employers often struggle to fill job vacancies, yet their hiring practices may actually reduce the pool of qualified job applicants. To acquire a talented workforce, employers must better identify the skills needed for specific jobs and communicate those needs to education providers, job seekers, and students.

- Asks Johnny Taylor to please share feedback you are hearing as you oversee a network of thousands of HR directors in the U.S. What are the ways companies are recruiting for nontraditional candidate pools?

**Johnny Taylor:**

- Short Term: Untapped talent in the incarcerated and elderly
  - Work with state and local organizations to bring training to jails
    - This will guarantee jobs when released and help keep them from going back into jail.
- Long Term: Identify kids and their talents early and start mentoring for a long-term strategy.
  - Example: LeBron James was recruited in middle school and was given the training and opportunity to succeed since a young child
- Businesses tell us they are no longer challenged as much by finding financial capital but finding human capital

**Ivanka Trump:** asks Craig Menear, Home Depot is a large employer and your seeking to recruit best talent. How do you determine if your hiring practices are successful?

**Craig Menear:**

- Pull employees from three different areas:
  - Brand and culture are well known
  - Internal (Home Depot University)
  - Market to potential candidates – introduce technology
    - Go to where folks are
    - Using machine learning and AI, they have increased the applicant pool by 22%.
    - Mobile apps and mobile applications - 50% of their job site traffic comes from their mobile site

- Home Depot University runs a 16-week program to provide employees with essential skills.
  - Need to differentiate levels of experience and skills
- Internally developed a program to match skill sets to jobs and can identify skill rates to types of jobs instantly

**Ivanka Trump:** asks Kim Reynolds, Iowa has the lowest unemployment rate in the country, how is the state bringing those outside of the workforce off the sidelines and connecting them to the jobs in demand?

**Kim Reynolds:**

- Grant programs for those to return to work and finish degree programs.
  - Started a Pell Grant Pilot Program – 420 inmates in college classroom with an average GPA of 3.5
- Work with transitioning military members.
- Make apprenticeships available
- The Iowa legislature for Future Ready Iowa
  - Also supported the Employer Innovation Fund – employers can create apprenticeships that are matched with state funding
- Help inmates get skills prior to them getting released
- Push mental healthcare reform so well people can work

**Wilber Ross:** Announced *Goal 4: Measure and Encourage Employer-led Training / Reskilling Investments*. The size, scope, and impacts of education and skills training investments are still not fully understood. There is a lack of consistent data on company balance sheets and in federal statistics. Business and policy makers need to know how much is spent on training, the types of workers receiving training, or the long-term value of the money and time spent in classroom and on-the-job training.

- Mentioned the Advisory Board will be splitting into four workgroups for future meetings.
- Hard stop
- Asks Al Kelly, I know your company is devoting a lot of time and effort in training skills and development. Can you tell us briefly more about your efforts and share your views to encourage or celebrate employer training initiatives?

**Al Kelly:**

- Issue comes down to three things:
  - Awareness
  - Access
  - Encouragement

- Create a national day or week of learning.
- Develop a public service campaign to make learning/training cool and fun.
- Meet in other locations around the country to draw more visibility and PR.

#### **Key Points on Data:**

- Gov Holcomb: The work they did with Markle to standardize the way multiple stakeholders describe a problem is important – this is foundational to user stories and creating shared taxonomies.
- Scott Pulsipher WGU: Their approach to skills based competency is a key element that needs to be replicated and expanded.
- Scott Sanders NASWA: Flagged Resume / Skills mismatch, machine reading will miss qualified applications if there is a terminology mismatch
- Craig Menear Home Depot: Increased sales 22% with an internal rank matching system based on skills, these kinds of internal systems are key for employers to make skill based hiring decisions
- Johnny Taylor SHRM: Early identification of talent, this is important for measuring competencies and aptitudes and coaching job seekers and reskilling efforts along a career pathway
- Marianne Wanamaker: Need national level data, state level data is insufficient to inform ROI decisions
- Michael Piwowar Milken Institute: Encouraged using data to measure the outcomes from the pledge for the American worker.

**BREAK:** 3:53 p.m.

**POTUS entered:** 4:17 p.m. (see remarks in Appendix B).

**Ivanka Trump:** Influenced legislative agenda. Reread high-level goals.

#### **Adjournment:**

The meeting adjourned at 4:51 PM EST.

#### **Appendices:**

- A. **Secretary Ross Remarks:** <https://www.commerce.gov/news/speeches/2019/03/remarks-us-commerce-secretary-wilbur-l-ross-american-workforce-policy>
- B. **President Trump:** Delivered brief remarks and asked for introductions from members around the table. See here: <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-president-trump-american-workforce-policy-advisory-board-meeting/>
- C. **AWPAB Public Comments - received prior to March 4, 2019, 5:30 p.m. EST deadline**
- D. **AWPAB Public Comments 2 – received after March 4, 2019, 5:30 p.m. EST deadline**
- E. **Full Audio of Meeting:** <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=C0AtKos3rUQ>

#### **Approval**

---

Kenneth White, Designated Federal Official (DFO)

---

Date

Office of Under Secretary for Economic Affairs

Department of Commerce